

Responding to Nouman Ali Khan's speech justifying hadith

Marwan Boustany

www.detailedquran.com

Link to his video: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bB4cARWalY4>

Refer to www.detailedquran.com for a series of articles that refute the need for hadith and the role of Muhammad as more than a messenger. I will follow his numbering in my responses (His bullet 1 and my bullet 1 etc.)

Nouman argument 1: Muhammad to be made a judge among Muslims. 2:45 – 9:00

فَلَا وَرَبِّكَ لَا يُؤْمِنُونَ حَتَّىٰ يُحَكِّمُوكَ فِيمَا شَجَرَ بَيْنَهُمْ ثُمَّ لَا يَجِدُوا فِي أَنفُسِهِمْ حَرَجًا مِّمَّا قَضَيْتَ وَيُسَلِّمُوا تَسْلِيمًا
وَلَوْ أَنَّا كَتَبْنَا عَلَيْهِمْ أَنِ اقْتُلُوا أَنفُسَكُمْ أَوِ اخْرُجُوا مِنْ دِيَارِكُمْ مَا فَعَلُوهُ إِلَّا قَلِيلٌ مِّنْهُمْ وَلَوْ أَنَّهُمْ فَعَلُوا مَا
يُوعِظُونَ بِهِ لَكَانَ خَيْرًا لَهُمْ وَأَشَدَّ تَثْبِيتًا

But no, by your Lord, they will not [truly] believe until they make you, [O Muhammad], judge concerning that over which they dispute among themselves and then find within themselves no discomfort from what you have decided and submit in [full, willing] submission.

And if We had decreed upon them, "Kill yourselves" or "Leave your homes," they would not have done it, except for a few of them. But if they had done what they were instructed, it would have been better for them and a firmer position [for them in faith].

Qur'an (4:65-66)

1. Allah swears only by himself (not objects or others like in other verses) “YOUR (Muhammad's) Master”. Meaning that this is a very weighty oath as it is not used elsewhere.
2. Allah says until they take YOU (Muhammed), and not specifically stating the Qur'an, as the decision maker in whatever issue they have. Prophet elevated to the level of being the ultimate decision/law maker, not the revelation or anything else in this ayah.
 - a. Further, we must have absolutely no discomfort over whatever the **messenger** has decided.
3. He asks why mention him (the messenger), why not say that the revelation should be the final decision maker?
4. Complete 'submissive loyalty' to the prophet is implied by 'yusallimu tasleema', continual submission indefinitely for all time.
5. What he (Muhammad presumably) asks you to do can only be based on wisdom, even if it doesn't make sense to you. Not in a position to question it.

Marwan response 1:

يَأْيُهَا النَّبِيُّ إِذَا جَاءَكَ الْمُؤْمِنَاتُ يُبَايِعْنَكَ عَلَىٰ أَنْ لَا يُشْرِكْنَ بِاللَّهِ شَيْئًا وَلَا يَسْرِقْنَ وَلَا يَزْنِينَ وَلَا يَقْتُلْنَ
أَوْلَادَهُنَّ وَلَا يَأْتِينَ بِبُهْتَانٍ يَفْتَرِينَهُ بَيْنَ أَيْدِيهِنَّ وَأَرْجُلِهِنَّ وَلَا يَعْصِيَنَّكَ فِي مَعْرُوفٍ فَبَايِعْنَهُنَّ وَأَسْتَغْفِرْ لَهُنَّ اللَّهُ
إِنَّ اللَّهَ غَفُورٌ رَحِيمٌ

“O Prophet! when believing women come to you giving you a pledge that they will not associate aught with Allah, and will not steal, and will not commit fornication, and will not kill their children, and will not bring a calumny which they have forged of themselves, **and will not disobey you in what is good**, accept their pledge, and ask forgiveness for them from Allah; surely Allah is Forgiving, Merciful.”
(60:12)

1. This is interesting, the topic of oaths needs further analysis.
 - a. Allah does swear by himself elsewhere, Nouman arbitrarily tries to say that Allah never swears by himself like in this ayah (4:65), however all the oaths are likely unique.
 - b. In 92:3 for example “And by He who created the male and the female”.
2. This explanation from Nouman is mistaken because he deliberately ignores other ayaat that clarify what this ayah can and cannot mean, some of these are listed below. Please also read: [Obey Allah and the Messenger](#)
 - Nouman indicates that 4:65 indicates that Muslims should abide by the judgments of Muhammad with complete submission. However from 60:12, we see that Allah indicates that Muhammad was to be obeyed in what is good. This would imply that people should judge the value of what Muhammad says and then obey, not just submit without thought. This leaves us with 2 options:
 - There is a contradiction in the Qur'an.
 - Nouman's interpretation is wrong.
 - There is no third option.
 - If Nouman's interpretation is wrong, how can we find the right one?

إِنَّ الْحُكْمَ إِلَّا لِلَّهِ أَمَرَ

“Surely the Hukm (Law and Judgment) is for none but Allah”
(12:40)

لَا يُشْرِكُ فِي حُكْمِهِ أَحَدًا

“He does not make anyone His associate in His Hukm (Law and Judgment)”
(18:26)

- The first key point is that Allah clarifies that Hukm/Judgment is ONLY for Allah. These ayaat leave no room for adding Muhammad or anyone else as a judge on any matter of religion not already established by Allah.

مَنْ يُطِيعِ الرَّسُولَ فَقَدْ أَطَاعَ اللَّهَ^ط وَمَنْ تَوَلَّىٰ فَمَا أَرْسَلْنَاكَ عَلَيْهِمْ حَفِيظًا

He who obeys the Messenger has obeyed Allah; but those who turn away - We have not sent you over them as a guardian.

(4:80)

- If only Allah judges and yet we are to take a judgement from Muhammad the messenger, then the only consistent understanding is that the judgement that the messenger shares is the judgement of Allah. If you read the following ayaat this becomes even clearer:

وَمَا كَانَ لِمُؤْمِنٍ وَلَا لِمُؤْمِنَةٍ إِذَا قَضَىٰ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ أَمْرًا أَنْ يَكُونَ لَهُمُ الْخِيَرَةُ مِنْ أَمْرِهِمْ وَمَنْ يَعْصِ اللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُ فَقَدْ ضَلَّ ضَلَالًا مُّبِينًا

“When Allah and His Messenger have decided something it is not for any man or woman of the believers to have a choice about it. Anyone who disobeys Allah and His Messenger is clearly misguided.”

(33:36)

- If you have not then please read my article on [Obey Allah and the Messenger](#).

إِنَّمَا كَانَ قَوْلَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ إِذَا دُعُوا إِلَى اللَّهِ وَرَسُولِهِ لِيَحْكُمَ بَيْنَهُمْ أَنْ يَقُولُوا سَمِعْنَا وَأَطَعْنَا وَأُولَٰئِكَ هُمُ الْمُفْلِحُونَ
The only statement of the [true] believers when they are called to Allah and His messenger to judge (singular form) between them is that they say, “We hear and we obey.” And those are the successful.

And whoever obeys Allah and His Messenger and fears Allah and is conscious of Him - it is those who are the successful.

(24:51-52)

- These ayaat tells us something interesting, the phrases “When Allah and the messenger have decided something” and “Allah and his messenger judge” mean when Allah has decided and when the messenger delivers (keep 12:40 and 18:26 in mind). This is not like what Nouman would like to believe (I guess) that Muhammad decides some religious points of law and Allah decides some other religious points of law. The fact is, Allah decides all religious points of law, the messenger merely relays them.
- These two references have a similar style to 4:65 and they both highlight that “Allah and the messenger” decide or judge. In 24:51, the verb following Allah and his messenger is in the singular form when it would be acceptable to have it in the plural form to denote the plurality of the messenger and Allah judging separately **if** that was the case (refer to the grammatical rules relating to verbs in verbal and nominal sentences). This may be indicating what I mentioned before, Allah judges and the messenger delivers, the two are one in purpose and command when the revelation comes.
- The key issue here is that to the people around the messenger, the words come from his

mouth and are to be obeyed, but the words come from Allah originally.

أَفَغَيْرَ اللَّهِ أَبْتَغِي حَكْمًا وَهُوَ الَّذِي أَنْزَلَ إِلَيْكُمُ الْكِتَابَ مُفَصَّلًا

“Shall I then seek a Judge other than Allah? When He it is Who has revealed to you the Book (Qur’an, which is) distinctly detailed”

(Qur’an, 6:114)

- This ayah has the messenger further clarifying that he seeks none other than Allah as a judge who has revealed the detailed Qur'an. Would he then also add his own judgement for people to follow? Especially when you consider “Say, "Indeed, I do not possess for you [the power of] harm or right direction.” Qur'an (72:21)

إِنَّا أَنْزَلْنَا إِلَيْكَ الْكِتَابَ بِالْحَقِّ لِتَحْكُمَ بَيْنَ النَّاسِ بِمَا أَرَاكَ اللَّهُ وَلَا تَكُنْ لِلخَائِنِينَ خَصِيمًا

“Surely We have revealed/sent down the Book (Qur’an) to you with the truth that **you may judge between people by means of that which Allah has showed/taught you**; and be not an advocate on behalf of the treacherous.”

(4:105)

- This ayah has Allah telling us and the messenger that all judgment performed by the messenger comes from what Allah has showed/taught him. Yet another elaboration that the messenger is not the source of judgments to be devoutly obeyed.

... وَمَنْ لَمْ يَحْكَمْ بِمَا أَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ فَأُولَئِكَ هُمُ الْكَافِرُونَ

... وَمَنْ لَمْ يَحْكَمْ بِمَا أَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ فَأُولَئِكَ هُمُ الظَّالِمُونَ

... وَمَنْ لَمْ يَحْكَمْ بِمَا أَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ فَأُولَئِكَ هُمُ الْفَاسِقُونَ

وَأَنْزَلْنَا إِلَيْكَ الْكِتَابَ بِالْحَقِّ مُصَدِّقًا لِمَا بَيْنَ يَدَيْهِ مِنَ الْكِتَابِ وَمُهَيِّمًا عَلَيْهِ فَاحْكُم بَيْنَهُمْ بِمَا أَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ وَلَا تَتَّبِعْ

... أَهْوَاءَهُمْ عَمَّا جَاءَكَ مِنَ الْحَقِّ

... وَأَنْ أَحْكُم بَيْنَهُمْ بِمَا أَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ وَلَا تَتَّبِعْ أَهْوَاءَهُمْ وَاحْذَرْهُمْ أَنْ يَفْتِنُوكَ عَنْ بَعْضِ مَا أَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ إِلَيْكَ

أَفْئُكُمُ الْجَاهِلِيَّةِ يَبْغُونَ وَمَنْ أَحْسَنُ مِنَ اللَّهِ حُكْمًا لِقَوْمٍ يُوقِنُونَ

And whoever does not judge by what Allah has revealed - then it is those who are the **disbelievers...**

And whoever does not judge by what Allah has revealed - then it is those who are the **wrongdoers...**

And whoever does not judge by what Allah has revealed - then it is those who are the defiantly **disobedient...**

And We have revealed to you, [O Muhammad], the Book in truth, confirming that which preceded it

of the Scripture and as a criterion over it. So judge between them by what **Allah has revealed** and do not follow their inclinations away from what has come to you of the truth...

And judge, [O Muhammad], between them **by what Allah has revealed** and do not follow their inclinations and beware of them, lest they tempt you away from some of what Allah has revealed to you.

Then is it the judgement of [the time of] ignorance they desire? **But who is better than Allah in judgement for a people who are certain [in faith].**

(5:44, 45, 47-50)

- This series of ayaat makes absolutely, repeatedly clear that we must judge ONLY by what is revealed
 - The very clear logical point here is that this does not allow for hadith in any way.
 - Hadith are not revealed and so can never be used for religious judgement.
 - It is logically inconsistent to say that you can only judge by what is revealed AND to say that what is revealed allows you to judge by what is not revealed (the non-Qur'anic words of Muhammad).
 - a. Judge only by A.
 - b. A (allegedly) says you can judge by B
 - c. Judge by A and/or B
 - a and c contradict.
 - If we look at 4:65 its starts with “And if We had decreed” in reference to Allah, when if we are to follow the thinking of Nouman, we should have the example of Muhammad decreeing something. Rather what we see is that in 4:65, we are told that Muslims were to make the Messenger the judge, and the judgements would come from Allah. This is the only harmonious interpretation.
3. Nouman needs to understand that for most of the life of the messenger, there was no complete, detailed and clear Qur'an for people to refer to. Rather they had:
- a. Revealed Qur'an stored in memory and on various recording media.
 - b. Ongoing revelation through the messenger as part of the plan of revelation to answer the challengers and to guide the community in an ongoing manner.
 - c. Yet to be revealed Qur'an through the messenger.
- The fact that prophets or messengers were always sent with revelation is a reflection of the sunnah of Allah, not evidence that these prophets and messengers could independently legislate religious law.
4. See answer 5 below.
5. This can only apply to the commands of Allah as the messenger does not know the unseen and cannot guide us.
- a. “Say, “Indeed, I do not possess for you [the power of] harm or right direction.” Qur'an (72:21)
 - b. Say [O Muhammad!]: “I do not say to you that I have the treasures of Allah nor that I know the unseen (ghayb). And I do not say to you that I am an angel. I only follow what is revealed to me.” Say [O Muhammad!]: “Are the blind and the seeing equal? Do you not think?” Qur'an (6.50)

c. “Surely the Hukm (Law and Judgment) is for none but Allah” Qur'an (12:40)

Nouman argument 2: The prophet's character as proof of the Qur'an. 9:30 – 10:38

وَإِنَّكَ لَعَلَىٰ خُلُقٍ عَظِيمٍ

And indeed, you are of a great moral character.

Qur'an (68:4)

1. The prophets character is so amazing that it acts to justify his messenger-hood. It's as though Allah is saying that the character of the prophet is proof of the Qur'an, so how can the character of prophet and what he does be insignificant - when these are used by Allah as evidence of the authenticity of the Qur'an.
 - a. How he looks and his smile are mentioned by Nouman.

Marwan response 2:

ن وَالْقَلَمِ وَمَا يَسْطُرُونَ ﴿١﴾ مَا أَنْتَ بِنِعْمَةِ رَبِّكَ بِمَجْنُونٍ ﴿٢﴾ وَإِنَّ لَكَ لَأَجْرًا غَيْرَ مَمْنُونٍ ﴿٣﴾ وَإِنَّكَ لَعَلَىٰ خُلُقٍ عَظِيمٍ ﴿٤﴾ فَسَتُبْصِرُ وَيُبْصِرُونَ ﴿٥﴾ بِأَيِّكُمْ الْمَفْتُونُ ﴿٦﴾ إِنَّ رَبَّكَ هُوَ أَعْلَمُ بِمَنْ ضَلَّ عَنْ سَبِيلِهِ وَهُوَ أَعْلَمُ

﴿٧﴾ بِالْمُهْتَدِينَ

“Nun. By the pen and what they inscribe, (1) You are not, [O Muhammad], by the favour of your Lord, a madman. (2) And indeed, for you is a reward uninterrupted. (3) And indeed, you are of a great moral character. (4) So you will see and they will see (5) Which of you is the afflicted [by a devil]. (6) Indeed, your Lord is most knowing of who has gone astray from His way, and He is most knowing of the [rightly] guided. (7)”

Qur'an (68:1-7)

1. The argument makes no sense and is only based on Nouman's external bias. Allah is defending the messenger against the claims of the deniers that he is a madman and/or afflicted etc. and verifying that Muhammad has a great character.

Nouman argument 3: The Qur'an is clear, so why other sources? 10:50 – 13:45

1. Original people that received the message heard the Qur'an and hadith from the mouth of the prophet with no 'physical' separation and so as one experience. They did not have Qur'an and hadith books to be referred to separately. (Minute: 11:20 – 12:00)
2. Why didn't Allah just send down the Qur'an separately? So people can separate it and not confuse it with the word of the prophet.
 - a. Allah did not send the prophet like a delivery service.
3. The Qur'an had to have been delivered by a living role model – not just a deliverer, but one living it. The Qur'an is all theory and we need the messenger to show us how to implement it, to clarify the message.
 - a. This makes the messenger and the message inseparable (slightly loops back to argument 2).
 - b. States that the Qur'an is 'generic' and it needs the messenger to make sense of it in a specific way.

Marwan response 3:

وَيَقُولُ الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَوْلَا نَزَلَتْ سُورَةٌ فَإِذَا أُنزِلَتْ سُورَةٌ مُحْكَمَةٌ وَذُكِرَ فِيهَا الْقِتَالُ رَأَيْتَ الَّذِينَ فِي قُلُوبِهِمْ مَرَضٌ يَنْظُرُونَ إِلَيْكَ نَظَرَ الْمَغْشِيِّ عَلَيْهِ مِنَ الْمَوْتِ فَأَوْلَىٰ لَهُمْ

Those who believe say, "Why has a surah not been sent down? But when a precise surah is revealed and fighting is mentioned therein, you see those in whose hearts is hypocrisy looking at you with a look of one overcome by death. And more appropriate for them [would have been]

Qur'an (47:20)

قُلْ أَطِيعُوا اللَّهَ وَأَطِيعُوا الرَّسُولَ فَإِن تَوَلَّوْا فَإِنَّمَا عَلَيْهِ مَا حُمِّلَ وَعَلَيْكُمْ مَا حُمِّلْتُمْ وَإِن تُطِيعُوهُ تَهْتَدُوا وَمَا عَلَى

... الرَّسُولِ إِلَّا الْبَلَاغُ الْمُبِينُ

Say, "Obey Allah and obey the Messenger; but if you turn away - then upon him is only that [duty] with which he has been charged, and upon you is that with which you have been charged. And if you obey him, you will be [rightly] guided. **And nothing is obligated on the messenger other than the clear deliverance (of the Qur'an).**"

Qur'an (24:54, see also 5:92, 64:12)

وَلَقَدْ صَرَّفْنَا لِلنَّاسِ فِي هَذَا الْقُرْآنِ مِنْ كُلِّ مَثَلٍ فَأَبَىٰ أَكْثَرُ النَّاسِ إِلَّا كُفُورًا

And We have certainly diversified for the people in this Qur'an from every [kind] of example, but most of the people refused [anything] except disbelief.

Qur'an (17:89)

1. As he admits in argument 4 (from minute 16:00), the Qur'an is/was distinguishable from normal speech.
 - a. The believers (2:23, 47:20, 5:101) , hypocrites (9:64, 47:20) and disbelievers (2:23, 11:13) all recognised that what Muhammad was coming with (whether they believe he made it up or that it was from Allah) came in surahs.
 - b. The people clearly looked for guidance in the Qur'an and not in his normal speech as can be seen in the above references, in 47:20 we see the believers are waiting for a surah to come with the guidance/judgement on fighting!
 - c. From 5:101 we also see that the believers recognised that what was coming from Allah was the Qur'an and that it was only at such a time that new information to answer questions or act as guidance could come. This clearly means that Muhammad was not in a position to answer such questions or provide such guidance outside of the Qur'an and its revelation.
 - d. While the messenger was one whole experience as a person, he was distinctly two people, a messenger with infallible guidance coming by revelation and a fallible man who made mistakes and could not be a source of guidance (See: 9:43, 66:1 and 6:50, 72:21)
2. The purpose of the messengers was to deliver the message and as part of this, establish its practice as much as possible in his leadership position. He was however no more than a messenger and he had no more of a role than the clear delivery of the message.
 - a. Please read [The role of the messenger](#)
 - b. Because the role of the messenger was to deliver the message of the Qur'an, there did not need to be separation as there was NO OTHER MESSAGE OR GUIDANCE coming from the messenger as is clearly the understanding of his audience from my point 1 above.
3. The way the Qur'an was delivered follows the sunnah of Allah with how other revelation was delivered to communities; by a prophet/messenger.
 - a. The Qur'an is detailed, clear and explained in itself, please see: [The Qur'an is Complete, Detailed, Sufficient and Understandable](#). It came with every kind of example (17:89, 39:27) specifically to explain its principles as needed. However Allah warns us that people like Nouman would “ not consent to anything but denying”.
 - b. Because Allah clarifies that the Qur'an has all we need for guidance, we do not need Muhammad to interpret how to practice it for us. Please recall:

قُلْ مَا كُنْتُ بِدَعَاءٍ مِّنَ الرُّسُلِ وَمَا أَدْرَىٰ مَا يُفْعَلُ بِي وَلَا بِكُمْ إِنَّا نَتَّبِعُ إِلَّا مَا يُوحَىٰ إِلَيَّ وَمَا أَنَا إِلَّا نَذِيرٌ مُّبِينٌ

“Say: ‘I am nothing new among the Messengers. I have no idea what will be done with me or you. I only follow what has been revealed to me. I am only a clear warner.’”

(46:9)

Nouman argument 4: The Qur'an is enough? 13:45 – 16:48

أَوَلَمْ يَكْفِهِمْ أَنَّا أَنْزَلْنَا عَلَيْكَ الْكِتَابَ يُتْلَىٰ عَلَيْهِمْ إِنَّ فِي ذَٰلِكَ لَرْحَمَةً وَّذِكْرًا لِّقَوْمٍ يُؤْمِنُونَ

And is it not sufficient for them that We revealed to you the Book which is recited to them? Indeed in that is a mercy and reminder for a people who believe.

Qur'an (29:51)

1. He claims here that the Qur'an claims in 29:51 that it is enough *as a miracle* not as guidance.
 - a. He says that this is in reference to the Quraysh asking for miracles like the previous miracles given to other messengers.
2. Acknowledges that the pattern of Qur'anic speech is different to the speech pattern of the messenger (video minute: 16:00)
 - a. The hadith does not approach the Qur'an in vocabulary, organisation and style.
 - b. Hadith and Qur'an are completely different and easily distinguishable.

Marwan response 4:

وَكَذَٰلِكَ أَنْزَلْنَا إِلَيْكَ الْكِتَابَ فَالَّذِينَ آتَيْنَاهُمُ الْكِتَابَ يُؤْمِنُونَ بِهِ وَمِنْ هَؤُلَاءِ مَنْ يُؤْمِنُ بِهِ وَمَا يَجْحَدُ بِآيَاتِنَا إِلَّا الْكَافِرُونَ ﴿48﴾ وَمَا كُنْتَ تَتْلُو مِنْ قَبْلِهِ مِنْ كِتَابٍ وَلَا تَخُطُّهُ بِيَمِينِكَ إِذًا لِآرْتَابِ الْمُبْطِلُونَ ﴿47﴾ بَلْ هُوَ آيَاتٌ بَيِّنَاتٌ فِي صُدُورِ الَّذِينَ أُوتُوا الْعِلْمَ وَمَا يَجْحَدُ بِآيَاتِنَا إِلَّا الظَّالِمُونَ ﴿49﴾ وَقَالُوا لَوْلَا أَنْزَلَ عَلَيْهِ آيَاتٌ مِنْ رَبِّهِ قُلْ إِنَّمَا الْآيَاتُ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ وَإِنَّمَا أَنَا نَذِيرٌ مُبِينٌ ﴿50﴾ أَوَلَمْ يَكْفِهِمْ أَنَّا أَنْزَلْنَا عَلَيْكَ الْكِتَابَ يُتْلَىٰ عَلَيْهِمْ إِنَّ فِي ذَٰلِكَ لَرْحَمَةً وَّذِكْرًا لِقَوْمٍ يُؤْمِنُونَ ﴿51﴾ قُلْ كَفَىٰ بِاللَّهِ بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَكُمْ شَهِيدًا يَعْلَمُ مَا فِي السَّمَاوَاتِ وَالْأَرْضِ

وَالَّذِينَ آمَنُوا بِالْبَاطِلِ وَكَفَرُوا بِاللَّهِ أُولَٰئِكَ هُمُ الْخَاسِرُونَ ﴿52﴾

And thus We have sent down to you the Book (Qur'an). And those to whom We [previously] gave the Book believe in it. And among these [people] are those who believe in it. And none reject Our ayaat except the disbelievers. (47) And you did not recite before it any Book, nor did you inscribe one with your right hand. Otherwise the falsifiers would have had [cause for] doubt. (48) Rather, it (the Qur'an) is distinct/clear ayaat [preserved] within the 'breasts' of those who have been given knowledge. And none reject Our ayaat except the wrongdoers. (49) **But they say, "Why are not ayaat sent down to him from his Lord?"** Say, "The ayaat are only with Allah, and I am only a clear warner." (50) **And is it not sufficient for them that We revealed to you the Book which is**

recited to them? Indeed in that is a mercy and reminder for a people who believe. (51) Say, "Sufficient is Allah between me and you as Witness. He knows what is in the heavens and earth. And they who have believed in falsehood and disbelieved in Allah - it is those who are the losers." (52). Qur'an (29:47-52)

وَلَقَدْ جِئْنَاهُمْ بِكِتَابٍ فَصَّلْنَاهُ عَلَىٰ عِلْمٍ هُدًى وَرَحْمَةً لِّقَوْمٍ يُؤْمِنُونَ

“And certainly We have brought them a Book, which We have detailed with knowledge, a guidance and mercy for a people who believe”
Qur'an (7:52)

تِلْكَ آيَاتُ اللَّهِ نَتْلُوهَا عَلَيْكَ بِالْحَقِّ فَبِأَيِّ حَدِيثٍ بَعْدَ اللَّهِ وَأَيَّاتِهِ يُؤْمِنُونَ

*These are the verses of Allah which We recite to you in truth. Then in what statement (Lit: **Hadith**) after Allah and His verses will they believe?*
(Qur'an, 45:6)

وَإِذَا تُلِيَتْ عَلَيْهِمْ آيَاتُنَا بَيِّنَاتٍ قَالَ الَّذِينَ لَا يَرْجُونَ لِقَاءَنَا إِنَّمَا بُرْحَانَ غَيْرِ هَذَا أَوْ بَدَّلَهُ قُلْ مَا يَكُونُ لِي أَنْ أُبَدِّلَهُ مِنْ تِلْقَاءِ نَفْسِي إِنْ أَتَّبَعُ إِلَّا مَا يُوْحَىٰ إِلَيَّ إِنِّي أَخَافُ إِنْ عَصَيْتُ رَبِّي عَذَابٌ يَوْمٍ عَظِيمٍ

And when Our clear ayaat are recited to them, those who do not expect the meeting with Us say, "Bring us a Qur'an other than this or change it." Say, [O Muhammad], "It is not for me to change it on my own accord. I only follow what is revealed to me. Indeed I fear, if I should disobey my Lord, the punishment of a tremendous Day."
Qur'an (10:15)

1. Please read 45:6 and read: [The Qur'an is Complete, Detailed, Sufficient and Understandable](#). This ayah is unambiguously telling us that we should believe (religiously) in NOTHING other than the recited ayaat of Allah. This is none other than the Qur'an.
 - a. He has himself in other [lectures](#) specifically discussed that ayaat mean miraculous signs, evidences, the smallest Qur'anic units etc. If we combine this with the understanding that ayaat of warning to the kuffar, hypocrites, Jews and Christians etc. all apply to us as Muslims, then this ayah would apply to Muslims in all the meanings of ayaat from 'verse' to to miraculous sign to evidence/proof.
 - i. In 29:47 ayaat can mean miraculous signs in general and also the 'verses' of the Book (Qur'an).
 - ii. 29:48 tells us that Muhammad had not followed/recited any book from before nor written one with his right hand. Here and 29:47 is referring to the revelation received by Muhammad, the Qur'an and in 29:49 Allah tells us that the Book is actually clear ayaat that are found in the 'chests' of those given knowledge. Note here, that these ayaat are 'verses or portions of revelation' not some water splitting type miracle.
 - iii. Compare 29:50 with 10:15. This ayah could be referring to any meaning of ayah

and is not limited to a major miracle. Of note also, is that Ayaat were revealed to answer the critics of the messenger (see all the 'Say' and 'they say' ayaat') as well as to give strength (25:32), so it may well be that right here the Quraysh (according to Nouman) were jeering the messenger “why don't you have your ayaat to answer us?”, and when something comes they don't like, we may get them saying “Bring us a Qur'an other than this or change it.” If Nouman wants to add context not in these ayaat (staff that turns into a snake, parting water) then we can get context also quite easily.

- iv. So taken in context, we do not have evidence to limit ayah to a major physical miracle and we have every right to take it for all its meanings as Nouman has so kindly defined in the previously linked video.
2. He acknowledges that the hearers of the words of the messenger could easily differentiate his normal speech from the Qur'an.
 - a. This goes against the implication of his argument in Argument 3 above, 1 and 1a (refer to video minute: 11:20-12:00 implying that it all seemed like one experience to the audience).
 - b. This does nothing to justify his argument that we need hadith.

Nouman argument 5: Hadith transmitted by the same people that transmitted the Qur'an 16:50 – 20:05

1. The narrators of the hadith are the same as narrated the Qur'an, so how can you accept the Qur'an and not the hadith.
 - a. Says Allah says he will protect the Qur'an, but not the hadith.
 - b. The people who transmitted Islam are the same people that transmitted the Qur'an and Hadith.
2. Says that the Qur'an was primarily a verbal tradition and that the writing of it came down the road as a formality.
3. Acknowledges that we must apply rigour to find if a statement is actually ascribable to the messenger.
 - a. He says that the same had to be done for the Qur'an.
4. Questioning hadith = questioning Qur'an.
5. The prophet was the first and living tafsir of the Qur'an
6. Goes on to explain just how hard and detailed a task it is to somehow contextualise a hadith.

Marwan response 5:

1. 15:9 is a promise by Allah to protect the Qur'an, why this promise unless the people themselves could be counted on to corrupt it? The fact is that the only thing safeguarded by Allah through these people is the Qur'an; their opinions and fabrications are worthless to us. That someone would faithfully transmit the Qur'an does not mean that he is righteous or guided.
 - a. When we understand that only the Qur'an is guidance, it makes sense that it is the only guidance is to be preserved.
 - b. These same people invented abrogation (read: [Here](#) and [here](#) and [here](#)) and lied about when and how the Qur'an was written as a book and transmitted ([Here](#) and [here](#) and [here](#) and [here](#)) and generally fabricated hadith like it was their mission.
2. This is a hadith based confusion, please read the following to see how Nouman is wrong here ([Here](#) and [here](#) and [here](#) and [here](#)).
3. It needed to be done to the hadith and still needs it because hadith were invented wholesale in the millions and a methodology (that is circular) was invented to make it look like it was possible to derive gems from the manure.
 - a. No it did not need to happen, for the very reason he himself stated, the Qur'an was massively tawatur (verbatim same thing narrated by many people). Whereas the hadith is massively ahaad (narrated by only ONE OR FEW people at its base). A useful introduction would be to read [this](#).
4. I would reply to Nouman, question Qur'an = question Allah.
5. Please read [The Qur'an is Complete, Detailed, Sufficient and Understandable](#) and ask yourself if the role of the messenger was to explain the Qur'an.
6. This is one of the many reasons that hadith, as a fabricated mass of lies created a theological hierarchy with which to control and subjugate the mind of people who dont have a decade of life to dedicate to chasing down the sources of chinese whispers.

قُلْ أَيُّ شَيْءٍ أَكْبَرُ شَهَادَةً قُلِ اللَّهُ شَهِيدٌ بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَكُمْ وَأُوحِيَ إِلَيَّ هَذَا الْقُرْآنُ لِأُنذِرَكُمْ بِهِ وَمَنْ بَلَغَ

Say, "What thing is greatest in testimony?" Say, "Allah is witness between you and me; and this Qur'an has been revealed to me that with it I may warn you and whomsoever it reaches."

Qur'an (6:19)